

## Swachh Bharath Mission - The Illusion of Success



(Source- [https://mir-s3-cdn-cf.behance.net/project\\_modules/disp/432a8115453005.5630f126cdfa0.jpg](https://mir-s3-cdn-cf.behance.net/project_modules/disp/432a8115453005.5630f126cdfa0.jpg) )

## In This Issue

### **LEAD ESSAY:**

- Swachh Bharath Mission - The Illusion of Success

### **HEADLINE OF THE WEEK:**

- The Muslim Personal Law Board's Intransigence Is Shocking.

### **SECTION 1: ECONOMY**

- The Modi Government Needs to Think Hard on Why GDP Is Slowing; Policy Change Needed in Bundelkhand to Prepare For Drought-Flood Cycles; Increased rural spend fails to cheer real rural wages.

### **SECTION 2: GOVERNANCE AND DEVELOPMENT**

- **Government:** Bill to regulate service norms of govt. staff introduced.
- **Security:** Delhi schools to come under CCTV surveillance.
- **Education:** Special education programme for disabled in Delhi govt schools.
- **Health:** Paternal Education Important to Reduce Child Undernutrition.
- **Transport:** A new solar rickshaw offers freedom from fumes.
- **Technology:** Reliance Announces Free Voice Calling, Cheaper Data Tariffs for Jio Customers.
- **Law and Justice:** What Singur Teaches Us About Land Rights; The Muslim Personal Law Board's Intransigence Is Shocking.

### **SECTION 3: SOCIETY**

- **Gender:** Womaniya empowerment: How prohibition has overturned the gender dynamic in Bihar's villages; Now, govt employees in Tamil Nadu can avail nine months maternity leave.
- **Social Justice:** After Russia, India Most 'Unequal'.

### **SECTION 4: INDIA AND WORLD**

- **Indian in the World:** Red Fort notice: Will Modi's new Pakistan policy go beyond rhetoric?; India and US sign military logistic agreement boosting defence ties.
- **East and South East Asia:** India and China: Asia's Uneasy Neighbors; Trustpolitik on the Korean Peninsula: Dead or Dormant?
- **Europe:** Don't panic- Brexit might just bring the UK closer to Europe.
- **Americas:** Here's why drug prices rise even when there's plenty of competition; In major win for River Rights, Dams proposed on five Chilean rivers Scrapped.

### **SECTION 5: OPINIONS/BOOKS**

- **Opinions:** The state of Education in India; Enemies of the state? Sedition charges in India rarely get substantiated.

## Lead Essay

### Swachh Bharath Mission - The Illusion of Success

#### Introduction

Out of 686 districts in India, 17 have achieved Open Defecation Free (ODF) status in India and in November, Kerala will become the first Indian state to achieve ODF status but, is this success just an illusion?<sup>1</sup>

The Swachh Bharat Mission (SBM) was launched in October 2014 with much fanfare under the guidance of Prime Minister, Mr. Modi. The mission has a very noble aim of improving the state of sanitation and cleanliness in India. While the aim is noble, the goals the mission has set out will be very difficult to achieve unless the mission takes into consideration the various gaps and takes suitable measures to amend its policy. One of the main objectives of the mission is to eradicate open defecation and solid and liquid waste management. In case of open defecation, the main reason for the underwhelming implementation of the scheme is that the mission does not fully account for the fact that structural changes will not lead to a change in the mindset of the people or their preferences. Understanding the reasons for people choosing open defecation is very important for the successful eradication of the practice of open defecation from India.

#### Open Defecation: The Problem

**“Open defecation refers to the practice whereby people go out in fields, bushes, forests, open bodies of water, or other open spaces rather than using the toilet to defecate.”**

The global rate of open defecation is 15% with 1 billion people engaging in the practice but, India's rate is four times that at 60% with almost **638 million people**. India produces over **65 million kilograms** of feces on streets, rail tracks and fields on a daily basis. The problem is more acute in rural areas with 70% rate of defecation as opposed to 13% in urban areas. Ending open defecation around the world was made a Millennium Development Goal by the UN owing to the scale and scope of its affects.

#### Negative Consequences

**Health:** It leads to spread of diseases, water contamination, childhood malnutrition, stunting, diarrheal disease and has even been linked to poverty and failed pregnancies. Although, diarrheal disease is treatable it is the second leading cause of death amongst children under the age of five and causes almost 750,000 deaths annually or around **1600 deaths daily**. Research has also shown relations between diarrhea and height stunting. Further, it has been known to increase pathways for transmission of polio, cholera, giardiasis and Hepatitis A.

**Women's Issues:** As they have to travel far to find secluded areas to defecate in the open, the risk of being sexually assaulted increases for women. They also prefer the dark for the privacy it accords them, which in turn puts them at further risk. **30% of marginalized women are violently assaulted** yearly and **24% of girls drop out of school** because of lack of a toilet, especially when they reach menarche. According to research, open defecation has also resulted in **high number of stillborn, preterm births and spontaneous abortions**.

**Poverty:** Open defecation leads to water, soil and land contamination reducing productivity. Children suffering from diseases find it difficult to complete their education and later their children's. Illness amongst senior citizens can also lead to a drain of family budgets thus, it perpetuates the poverty cycle.

<sup>1</sup> Dipak.K.Dash, '16 districts open-defecation free, 661 more to go', Times of India, June 26, 2016, Available at: <http://timesofindia.indiatimes.com/india/16-districts-open-defecation-free-661-more-to-go/articleshow/52921204.cms>

## Lead Essay

**Economy:** Open defecation leads to reduction in worker's productivity due to work absences and health issues,<sup>2</sup> leads to inability to save and thus, impacts overall national development. The economic impact of open defecation on India is estimated to be about **2.4 trillion rupees or about 6.4% of India's GDP according to the World Bank.**<sup>3</sup>

### Swachh Bharat : The Policy

**Swachh Bharat Abhiyan** is primarily divided into the **Swachh Bharat Gramin Mission** and the **Swachh Bharat Urban Mission**. It is being implemented by the Ministry of Urban Development (MoUD) for urban areas and by The Ministry of Drinking Water and Sanitation (Mo DWS) for rural areas. The scheme is based on the National Urban Sanitation Policy and each state was invited to submit city and state level sanitation strategies. The mission aims to eradicate OD by 2 October, 2019 and the cost for the SBM is calculated at **22 billion dollars**. Each urban household would be given Rs. 4000 as incentive for construction of household toilets while the incentive is Rs. 12,000 for rural households.

### Mission Objectives

#### For Swachh Bharat Mission Urban :

1. Elimination of Open Defecation
2. Modern and Scientific Municipal Solid Waste Management
3. Eradication of Manual Scavenging
4. To effect behavioral change regarding healthy sanitation practices
5. Generate awareness about sanitation and its linkage with public health
6. Capacity Augmentation for ULB's
7. To create an enabling environment for private sector participation in Capex (capital expenditure) and Opex (operation and maintenance)

#### For Swachh Bharat Mission Gramin :

1. Bring about an improvement in the general quality of life in the rural areas.
2. Accelerate sanitation coverage in rural areas to achieve the vision of Swachh Bharat by 2019 with all Gram Panchayats in the country attaining Nirmal status.
3. Encourage cost effective and appropriate technologies for ecologically safe and sustainable sanitation.
4. Motivate communities and Panchayati Raj Institutions promoting sustainable sanitation facilities through awareness creation and health education.
5. Develop community managed environmental sanitation systems focusing on solid & liquid waste management for overall cleanliness in the rural areas.<sup>4</sup>

<sup>2</sup> WPP Government & Public Sector Practice, J.Walter Thompson India & University of Oxford, Blavatnik School of Government, 'Social & Behavior Change Communication Insights and Strategy Case Study: Open Defecation in India', 2016, Available at : <http://www.wpp.com/govtpractice/insights/creating-demand-health/>. Pg 7, P3

<sup>3</sup> Water and Sanitation Program, World Bank Report, 'THE ECONOMIC IMPACTS OF INADEQUATE SANITATION IN INDIA Inadequate Sanitation Costs India Rs. 2.4 Trillion (US\$53.8 Billion)', Available at : <https://www.wsp.org/sites/wsp.org/files/publications/wsp-esi-india.pdf>

<sup>4</sup> Swachh Bharat Mission Guidelines Available at: [http://swachhbharaturban.gov.in/writereaddata/SBM\\_Guideline.pdf](http://swachhbharaturban.gov.in/writereaddata/SBM_Guideline.pdf) and <http://mdws.gov.in/sites/default/files/SwachBharatGuidelines.pdf>

## Lead Essay

### Policy Gaps

#### 1. Reasons for Open Defecation (OD) are Cultural, and not just Infrastructure related

The main difficulty with reaching an ODF (Open Defecation Free) status in India through the SBM is that the scheme focuses primarily on building toilets rather than focusing on increasing the demand for toilets amongst the people by creating the necessary awareness regarding the usage of toilets. The key to increasing demand is, understanding the reasons for open defecation. According to the SQUAT survey on individual defecation behavior in rural Haryana, Madhya Pradesh, Rajasthan and Bihar the main reasons cited for OD are as follows:

- The main factors influencing rate of OD are **not poverty, illiteracy or lack of water**. It is the perception around using a toilet.
- Preference: 88.4% of the people in the SQUAT survey cited **comfort and convenience** as the reason for OD. On the other hand, “people find toilets **repulsive** and they are seen as smelly, dark, small, enclosed spaces that need to be emptied and furthermore, they cost a lot of money.” It is viewed as an **unaffordable luxury** which costs about Rs.21, 000.
- **Access and availability** of functioning latrines.
- Since the whole community does it, it has become a **traditional practice, local culture or daily routine**.
- The belief that, open defecation **is healthier** than using a toilet. People associate it with being industrious and healthy as they end up breathing fresh air and taking walks.
- **Religious beliefs:** Based on various reports, the “beliefs, values, and norms about purity and pollution of private spaces and of bodies” lead to high levels of OD. Using a toilet is considered ritually impure and polluting and it is considered to promote purity and strength, particularly amongst men. One cannot defecate in the same house in which they eat and their means of purification are rituals which make toilets less appropriate. Research done by Michael Geruso and Dean Spears, establishes a correlation between religious beliefs and latrine use by taking passages from Manusmriti.

Far from his dwelling let him remove urine and excreta  
{The Laws of Manu (Hindu sacred text), Chapter 4 verse 151

The relation between religion and toilet use is also a factor explored in the SQUAT survey as one of the factors affecting OD in India.<sup>5</sup>

- **Casteism** also plays a role in OD as the lower castes are usually assigned to toilet cleaning. If emptying the latrine is problematic for the higher classes they would be less likely to use them. The rates of OD are the **highest amongst SC/ST** and their defecation sites are also usually separate from higher class OD sites.<sup>6</sup>
- **Gender:** Most people believe that toilets must be built for women, for their convenience, safety, and privacy. Women who are otherwise restricted to their home may actually have a preference for OD. Most of these women are not in favor of toilets as, it is the only time during the day when they can leave the house and socialize. The situation is further aggravated by the “usual resistance” of men who would rather spend the money on other commodities.<sup>7 8</sup>

<sup>5</sup> ‘Ending Open Defecation in India: Insights on Implementation and Behavior Change for Swachh Bharat Abhiyan’, Princeton University's Woodrow Wilson School of Public and International Affairs (WWS), August- December 2015, Available at: [https://wvs.princeton.edu/sites/default/files/content/India%20Workshop%20Report\\_FINAL\\_2.25.2016.pdf](https://wvs.princeton.edu/sites/default/files/content/India%20Workshop%20Report_FINAL_2.25.2016.pdf), Pg1, P3

Ibid, Pg14,P1

<sup>7</sup> Ibid,Pg20, P2

<sup>8</sup> Aman Sharma, ‘The reluctant Indian men hurdle in toilet drive: Government’, September 6,2016, Available at: <http://economictimes.indiatimes.com/news/politics-and-nation/the-reluctant-indian-men-hurdles-in-toilet-drive-government/articleshow/54023178.cms>

## Lead Essay

Amongst mostly cultural or preference based reasons, the **availability of toilets is only one of the factors** which leads to OD. **Over half of the people who owned a Government built toilet, still chose to OD and 2/3<sup>rd</sup> of such households had at least one member who defecated in the open.** Considering this, the policy should focus more on changing the perception of the people about OD rather than focusing on building toilets. **The budget allocated towards Behavior Change Considerations (BCC) and IEC is just 15% which also includes capacity building.**

### 2. Difficulty of Verifying ODF Status

Kerala is going to become the first Open Defecation Free State in November and while the efforts of the state must be lauded, the question of verification of the ODF status must be considered. SBM aims at making India ODF by 2019 but, it poses many data measurement, reporting and evaluation challenges. With an investment of billions without proper data to back up the claim of ODF states the mission cannot be called a success. For example, the 1.5 billion \$ loan from World Bank will be given to the states depending on their performance in building toilets. The building of toilets alone will not lead to ODF status being achieved thus, policy makers should make sure that there are proper mechanisms to measure progress or it would lead to the wastage of national resources and OD will not be eradicated.<sup>9</sup>

In June 2015, the Joint Secretary of the rural SBM issued a directive to all states with a universal definition of ODF status, defined by **“no visible faeces found in the environment/village and every household as well as public/community institutions using safe technology option for disposal of faeces.”**

#### Indicators:

- no contamination of surface soil, groundwater, or surface water
- no handling of fresh excreta
- excreta inaccessible to flies and animals
- freedom from odor and unsightly condition

Further, Since ODF is not a one-time process; at least two rounds of verifications may be carried out. The first verification may be carried out within three months of the declaration to verify the ODF status. Thereafter, in order to ensure sustainability of ODF, one more verification may be carried out after around six months of the first verification. The verification can be done by state or third parties and upon declaration the status will again be confirmed by the Central Government.<sup>10</sup> This is a very important step towards measuring the success of the program but, it is **difficult to ascertain the accuracy of the data.**

There are various methods of observation:

- Household/Village Surveys
- Electronic Means - Passive Latrine Use Monitors (PLUMs)
- Presence of flies, feces or bad odor
- Hand washing and access to soap and water

Household/Village surveys face the difficulties and cost associated with interview training. The data collected can be over reported or biased. Thus, the accuracy of the survey comes under scrutiny. Similarly, the criteria for the surveys are the absence of fecal matter, flies and bad odor which is very difficult to verify or collect data on. The same reasons can be a hindrance in verifying whether people are washing hands after using the toilet.

<sup>9</sup> Aman Sharma, '1.5 billion \$ loan from World Bank to be given to states depending on performance in building toilets', August 6, 2016, Available at <http://economictimes.indiatimes.com/news/politics-and-nation/1-5-billion-loan-from-world-bank-to-be-given-to-states-depending-on-performance-in-building-toilets/articleshow/53565918.cms>.

<sup>10</sup> Government of India, Guidelines for ODF Verification, Available at: [http://mdws.gov.in/sites/default/files/R\\_274\\_1441280478318.pdf](http://mdws.gov.in/sites/default/files/R_274_1441280478318.pdf).

## Lead Essay

The electronic methods, such as PLUMs, are usually expensive and it is difficult to get permission to install such monitoring devices, for example, the PLUMs were installed in a household toilet and recorded when someone entered and exited the space. If the family knows it is being monitored it may act differently as well, Hawthorne effect. Further, observing someone in their most intimate moments also brings in the issue of privacy rights.

Thus, while SBM has tried to institute a very stringent multi level verification process for granting ODF status under its guidelines, the criteria for verification is vague and data on the same may not be collected accurately. ODF status granted to villages and states needs to be verified using more accurate measures to ensure actual eradication of OD in India.

### 3. High Density OD Areas at Greater Risk

The levels of OD have become the leading sanitation measure under SBM but, the most important measure is actually the density of OD. Areas with high OD density are at a higher risk of health problems. SBM must take this key issue into consideration while revisiting the goals of the mission.<sup>11</sup>

### 4. Behavior Change Considerations

The aim of BCC activities is to make people aware of the consequences of OD and then provide them with knowledge about toilet usage and maintenance and therefore to increase usage of toilets. This can lead to a lasting behavioral change or adjustment. According to World Bank, between 1981 and 2012, the sanitation coverage in India has gone from 1% to 24.7%. However, the construction of latrines has not led to their use. The same problem is being faced by SBM as well. The role of communication is to make people look at latrine use as virtuous and progressive so that over time it becomes the norm. The Government must also communicate to the beneficiaries the health and economic benefits, which they are usually not aware of. SBM does include a multipronged National Reachout Campaign but, in the **SQUAT survey** conducted by RICE institute **only 62% of the respondents were aware of any such campaign** and only 30% reported seeing a pamphlet, wall writing or poster about latrines and only 9% reported seeing a play or movie. These numbers suggest that the SBM efforts to create awareness have failed to reach the rural villagers.

Research has shown that countries such as Bangladesh and Vietnam, with smaller economies than India, have managed to achieve OD by focusing on BCC activities. India is the only country which has even incentivized toilet usage but, the scheme does not account for lapsed or sporadic users. BCC is the key to ending OD in India yet; the focus has been on toilet building rather than improving usage.

### 5. Manual Scavenging

**“The Swachh Bharat Abhiyan has no meaning while manual scavenging remains a reality.”**

According to the **Socio Economic Caste Census 2011**, about 180,657 households are engaged in manual scavenging for livelihood. The profession of manual scavenging is prevalent amongst the lower castes despite being banned and SBM has not been able to incorporate measures to ensure that the building of toilets will not lead to increasing the number of manual scavengers. The focus of SBM is on building toilets could well lead to an increase in septic tanks and sewers which will need to be cleaned. This is a step back from efforts made towards eradicating manual scavenging in India. The policy does not take a holistic view to the problem of OD and may lead to perpetuating the abhorrent practice of manual scavenging.

---

<sup>11</sup> Ending Open Defecation in India: Insights on Implementation and Behavior Change for Swachh Bharat Abhiyan', Princeton University's Woodrow Wilson School of Public and International Affairs (WWS), August- December 2015, Available at: [https://www.princeton.edu/sites/default/files/content/India%20Workshop%20Report\\_FINAL\\_2.25.2016.pdf](https://www.princeton.edu/sites/default/files/content/India%20Workshop%20Report_FINAL_2.25.2016.pdf), Pg25-33

## Lead Essay

The **International Labour Organisation (ILO)** describes three forms of manual scavenging in India:

- Removal of human excrement from public streets and "dry latrines" (meaning simple pit latrines without a water seal)
- Cleaning septic tanks
- Cleaning gutters and sewers

“The practice is punishable with imprisonment for up to one year and a fine of 2000rs under **Employment of Manual Scavengers and Construction of Dry Latrines (Prohibition) Act, 1993** and includes septic tanks and sewer lines but, not one person has been booked for engaging in cleaning of septic tanks. Later, the **Prohibition of Employment as Manual Scavengers and their Rehabilitation Act 2013** or "M.S. Rules 2013" were introduced but, the implementation of the rules has been lacking. The paradox is that, most people engaging in this line of work know the consequences to their physical and mental health but, due to lack of other job opportunities they still choose to clean. A septic tank takes about six hours to clean and about 3 cleaners. They earn 400rs from cleaning such tanks and face the risk of being bitten by poisonous reptiles or insects as well.

**Bezwada Wilson**, the founder of ‘**Safai Karamchari Andolan**’, a movement aimed at ending manual scavenging in India and the recent recipient of the Magsaysay award, blames the lack of initiative on the part of the authorities in not cleaning the tanks mechanically. In light of the deaths associated with manual **scavenging Deepak Hastir, Additional Commissioner of MCD** states that “Under the Swachh Bharat Abhiyan, we are pushing forward a proposal that will stop employing children below 14 years of age in collecting trash. Under this proposal, every rag picker, even the one employed by the NGOs, should be provided a protective gear.” While the attempts at eradicating manual scavengers in India have been made for many years, the implementation is underwhelming.<sup>121314</sup>

### Recommendations

Various reports and activists working on the ground with people practicing OD in India have offered numerous criticisms for the SBM but, the policy remains largely unchanged and still does not address the main causes of people choosing OD over using government built toilets. Swachh Bharat’s urban-toilet plan is running **76% behind schedule**, of a target of 2.5 million household toilets in urban areas by March 2016, **24%** (0.6 million) have been constructed and of a target of 100,000 community and public toilet seats in urban areas by March 2016, **28%** (28,948) have been constructed. Almost **85 million** people lack adequate sanitation in India and policy makers need to pay heed to the recommendations and make attempts at revamping the scheme to address its shortcomings, if it aims to achieve the eradication of OD in India by 2019.<sup>15</sup>

- SBM needs to stop promoting itself as a means to promote women’s dignity and must promote it in **gender neutral** way. By promoting it as a women’s issue, it further substantiates the prevalent viewpoint that sanitation is a women’s issue. **Women are less likely to OD than men but, it does not represent a higher demand** for toilets amongst women. The building of toilets may further lead to their seclusion and hamper their emotional well being in some areas but, evidence of women empowerment has been seen in states like Rajasthan where women are

<sup>12</sup>Adila Matra, ‘The shameful reality behind Swachh Bharat: Despite carrying a jail term manual scavenging is still a lucrative trade in caste-riven India’, Daily Mail, 1 August 2015, Available at: <http://www.dailymail.co.uk/indiahome/indianews/article-3182568/The-shameful-reality-Swachh-Bharat-Despite-carrying-jail-term-manual-scavenging-lucrative-trade.html>.

<sup>13</sup>Pran K. Vasudeva, ‘Manual Scavenging Flies in the Face of Swachh Bharat Mission’, The Citizen, 18 March, 2016, Available at: <http://www.thecitizen.in/index.php/NewsDetail/index/9/7170/Manual-Scavenging-Flies-in-the-Face-of-Swachh-Bharat-Mission>.

<sup>14</sup>‘Who will clean the Swachh Bharat toilets, asks Wilson’, The Hindu, August 23, 2016, Available at: <http://www.thehindu.com/news/cities/Delhi/who-will-clean-the-swachh-bharat-toilets-asks-wilson/article9021946.ece>.

<sup>15</sup>Prachi Salve, ‘Swachh Bharat’s urban-toilet plan is running 76% behind schedule’, Scroll, 29 April, 2016, Available at : <http://scroll.in/article/807261/swachh-bharats-urban-toilet-plan-is-running-76-behind-schedule>

## Lead Essay

spearheading the sanitation campaigns and toilet building initiatives which has further led to increase in awareness and use of toilets by men. Gender is an important aspect of OD in India, but it must not become the focus point as that will deviate from the actual mission of promoting sanitation in India across members of all age, caste, sex and religions.<sup>16</sup>

- **‘Difficult areas’**: Sanitation spending has not been significantly higher in areas that are more likely to have behavioral barriers to eliminating OD. Decision makers should increase the focus on these “difficult” areas, in terms of actual spending. For example, in areas with low levels of literacy appropriate change management interventions need to be taken after taking into consideration the various barriers to implementation of regular BCC programs.
- Certain social and religious communities have a **higher propensity to OD** in comparison to others due to their beliefs. Special measures must be taken to tackle the problem by focusing BCC activities on target groups which have been identified as having high levels of OD.
- The state must increase spending on **BCC and IEC activities** by learning from the examples of **Bangladesh and Vietnam** as changing the mindset of the people towards using toilets is the key to ending OD in India. **Community Led Total Sanitation (CLTS)** as a BCC method must be undertaken to change perceptions. The crux of the CLTS program has been making people aware that they are ingesting other people’s fecal matter and this has been proved as a successful means of promoting toilet use. Attempts must be made towards increasing the demand for using toilets and the Government needs to create material which will be able to reach rural populations and the Front Line Workers must be equipped to use them.
- The private sector under its **Corporate Social Responsibility** program has contributed towards toilet building projects but, now they must work towards incorporating **change management**. They could support initiatives that focus on changing public opinion about using toilets by stressing on the consequences of OD.
- The advantages of usage of more **technologically advanced models**, which do not require cleaning of septic tanks or sewers and can separate waste, must be recognized as an attempt to curing the problem of manual scavenging.
- **Assessment measures** towards ODF status are not really appropriate as building of toilets alone does not ensure usage. For example, in Punjab teachers have been deputed to visit houses and verify the process of setting up toilets in villages under the Swachh Bharat Mission Grameen.<sup>17</sup> Monitoring and evaluation of SBM in India will require new measures. Prior attempts at sanitation in India have failed due to the same reason. The villages which have achieved ODF status must be surveyed regularly to prevent relapses. Further, the criteria for granting ODF status must be amended as the current verification guidelines may not be based on accurate data.
- **Children** must be seen as the key to breaking the inter-generational cycle. They must be taught to use toilets and once it becomes a habit they might even become agents of change in their households. Similarly, **teachers** must become guides in changing the perception of children towards OD.

<sup>16</sup> Somya Sethuram, Debate: Sanitation Campaigns in Rural Rajasthan Do Not Promote Patriarchy, 12 June, 2015, Available at <http://thewire.in/3730/debate-sanitation-campaigns-in-rural-rajasthan-do-not-promote-patriarchy/>

<sup>17</sup> Aparna Banerji, ‘Now, teachers put on toilet verification duty,’ August 15, 2016, Available at : <http://www.tribuneindia.com/news/punjab/now-teachers-put-on-toilet-verification-duty/280778.html>

## Lead Essay

- The consequences of OD must be explained to the families and the policy makers must realize that making more stringent efforts will relieve **6.4% of the GDP** which is currently being used to tackle public health issues and low productivity as a consequence of OD.

### Conclusion

The above recommendations highlight the major aspects of SBM which need to be amended to successfully eradicate OD in India. Emphasis must be on communication but, it must be undertaken along with other aspects of the program for better results. The SBM must work towards undertaking effective BCC campaigns to change public opinion about usage of toilets. There must be a shift of focus in the policy, from toilet making to spreading awareness about toilet usage. The aim of achieving ODF status in India is a noble one but, without proper means to collect data accurately and verify the status, it will lead to wastage of national resources and efforts. Therefore, the recommendations must be implemented to fast track the progress of the mission and more importantly to accurately measure success otherwise achieving ODF status by 2019 will be very difficult.<sup>18</sup>

<sup>i</sup> Swachh Bharat Mission Guidelines Available at: [http://swachhbharaturban.gov.in/writereaddata/SBM\\_Guideline.pdf](http://swachhbharaturban.gov.in/writereaddata/SBM_Guideline.pdf) and <http://mdws.gov.in/sites/default/files/SwachBharatGuidelines.pdf>

‘Ending Open Defecation in India: Insights on Implementation and Behavior Change for Swachh Bharat Abhiyan’, Princeton University's Woodrow Wilson School of Public and International Affairs (WWS), August- December 2015, Available at:

[https://wvs.princeton.edu/sites/default/files/content/India%20Workshop%20Report\\_FINAL\\_2.25.2016.pdf](https://wvs.princeton.edu/sites/default/files/content/India%20Workshop%20Report_FINAL_2.25.2016.pdf)

Unicef, ‘Eliminate Open Defecation’, Available at : <http://unicef.in/Whatwedo/11/Eliminate-Open-Defecation>

WPP Government & Public Sector Practice, J.Walter Thompson India & University of Oxford, Blavatnik School of Government, ‘Social & Behavior Change Communication Insights and Strategy Case Study: Open Defecation in India’, 2016, Available at : <http://www.wpp.com/govtpractice/insights/creating-demand-health/>.

Research Institute for Compassionate Economics, SQUAT SURVEY, Available at: <http://riceinstitute.org/data/squat/>.

**Prepared by:**  
Wamika Kapur

---

---

## Headlines

### **The Muslim Personal Law Board's Intransigence Is Shocking**

(A Faizur Rahman, *The Wire*, September 5, 2016)

If any Muslim woman had been bold enough to think that the All India Muslim Personal Law Board (AIMPLB) would moderate its medievalism given the unprecedented judicial scrutiny on triple talaq, her hopes stand dashed – perhaps permanently – for such is the outrageousness of some of the board's arguments before the Supreme Court in the Shayara Bano case.

Read More: <http://thewire.in/63995/the-muslim-personal-law-boards-intransigence-is-shocking/>

Date Accessed: 5.9.2016

## Economy

### **The Modi Government Needs to Think Hard on Why GDP Is Slowing**

(M.K. Venu, *Thewire*, September 01, 2016)

The GDP growth figure of 7.1% for the April-June quarter must come as a big dampener for the optimists in the NDA government who had convinced themselves that the Indian economy was decisively moving to a higher trajectory. Only a few days ago the chairman of Niti Aayog, Arvind Panagariya, said India would grow at 8% this fiscal. Panagariya must be regretting making that public claim now.

The April-June data not only shows that India's GDP is decelerating, it also reveals another worrisome trend – the growth in gross fixed capital formation, a measure of the investments in the economy, is falling further in the negative territory. The growth in overall investment was recorded at minus 3% in the April-June quarter. This, inspite of the government having upped its capital spending by over 18%. What this clearly tells us is that private investment is not reviving yet.

Read More: <http://thewire.in/63360/modi-led-nda-needs-to-think-hard-on-why-gdp-is-slowing/>

Date Accessed: 02.9.2016

### **Policy Change Needed in Bundelkhand to Prepare For Drought-Flood Cycles**

(Bharat Dogra, *Thewire*, September 02, 2016)

Bundelkhand: Although Bundelkhand has been experiencing adverse and erratic weather conditions for several years, the current adverse phase began in February 2015 with untimely heavy rains and hailstorms, which continued with a few breaks for some weeks and destroyed the ripening rabi (winter) crop in most villages. Nearly a year-and-a-half later, in August this year, excess rain and floods have once again caused extensive damage to agriculture in many villages, although the precise extent of the loss will be known only after awhile.

In between these two events of excess rain, there was a prolonged drought that destroyed two successive crops. Over a cycle of four crops, two were destroyed by drought and the other two were ravaged by floods.

This appears to be a manifestation of climate change that has been worsened by local factors. The Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change has said in its fifth assessment report that the impact of climate change will depend as much on the volume of change brought by greenhouse gas emissions as on the local socio-economic and environmental factors.

Read More: <http://thewire.in/63353/for-bundelkhand-to-prepare-for-cycles-of-drought-and-floods-there-is-an-urgent-need-for-policy-changes/>

Date Accessed: 02.9.2016

### **Increased rural spend fails to cheer real rural wages**

(Harsha Jethmalani, *livemint*, September 01, 2016)

The Central government has raised wages for its own employees and mandated higher minimum wages, but the fact remains that real rural wages continue to fall.

This has happened despite all the talk about reviving India's ailing rural economy, so much so that Prime Minister Narendra Modi earlier this year set a target to double farmers' income by 2022. But certain things are easier said than done.

Read More: <http://www.livemint.com/Money/Jbb7PUsgPbNDt6akF4wuJL/Increased-rural-spend-fails-to-cheer-real-rural-wages.html>

Date Accessed: 02.9.2016

## Governance & Development

### GOVERNMENT

#### Bill to regulate service norms of govt. staff introduced

(*The Hindu*, September 2, 2016)

Stating the objects and reasons of the Tamil Nadu Government Servants (Conditions of Service) Bill, 2016 in the Assembly, Finance Minister O. Panneerselvam said that at present, the recruitment and conditions of service of persons appointed to public services and posts in connection with the affairs of the State are regulated by the rules made under the proviso to Article 309 of the Constitution of India.

Read More: <http://www.thehindu.com/news/national/tamil-nadu/bill-to-regulate-service-norms-of-govt-staff-introduced/article9061084.ece?homepage=true?w=alstates>

Date Accessed: 2.9.2016

### SECURITY

#### Delhi schools to come under CCTV surveillance

(*India Today*, September 1, 2016)

Addressing a conference on 'Quality Education for All-Role of Affordable and Accessible Technology', Delhi's Education Secretary Punya Salila Shrivastava said, "We are bringing in CCTVs not just for the purpose of security but as tool which will help us to do a time on task study of how the teaching is going on in our class because we have to optimise and ensure that we don't waste too much resources."

Read More: <http://indiatoday.intoday.in/education/story/delhi-schools-to-come-under-cctv-surveillance/1/754059.html>

Date Accessed: 2.9.2016

### EDUCATION

#### Special education programme for disabled in Delhi govt schools

(*Times of India*, August 28, 2016)

Every disabled child studying in Delhi government run and aided schools will now get personal attention with the AAP government asking special educators to prepare an individualized education programme (IEP)

Read More: <http://timesofindia.indiatimes.com/home/education/news/Special-education-programme-for-disabled-in-Delhi-govt-schools/articleshow/53896239.cms>

Date Accessed: 1.9.2016

### HEALTH

#### Paternal Education Important to Reduce Child Undernutrition

(Nikita Mehta, *The Livemint*, August 10, 2016)

A new study published on Tuesday shows that paternal education levels play an important role in lowering childhood undernutrition. Earlier studies have established that maternal education levels are associated with lower childhood undernutrition. Stunting is prevalent among 38.7% of India's children aged under five, according to the Global Nutrition Report 2016, which ranked India 114 among 132 countries, where the country ranked 132nd had the highest prevalence of stunting.

Read More: <http://www.livemint.com/Politics/OLi0Slv6jDDBsrxEdN0MbO/Paternal-education-as-important-as-maternal-education-in-red.html>

Date Accessed: 5.9.2016

## Governance & Development

### TRANSPORT

#### **A new solar rickshaw offers freedom from fumes**

(Sapna Gopal, Scroll, August 29, 2016)

Even as debates rage over the alarming levels of pollution in cities across the country, the battery operated e-rickshaws have come as a breath of fresh air. After New Delhi, where they found legal approval, Allahabad in Uttar Pradesh, and recently, Ludhiana in Punjab have seen use of these vehicles. In Maharashtra, they are operating in Mumbai, Pune, Nagpur and Nashik. In Kerala, the port city of Kochi is now in the news, for an e-rickshaw powered by solar energy will hit the road on August 16.

Read More: <http://scroll.in/article/814793/a-new-solar-rickshaw-offers-freedom-from-fumes>

Date of Access: 30.8.2016

### TECHNOLOGY

#### **Reliance Announces Free Voice Calling, Cheaper Data Tariffs for Jio Customers**

(The Wire, September 1, 2016)

Reliance Industries chairman Mukesh Ambani today announced free voice calling, zero roaming charges and cheaper data tariffs for Jio customers. Ambani also announced a 'free welcome offer' for Jio customers from September 5 till December 31. R Jio will offer users data services free for four months, after which it will offer 10 tariff plans starting at Rs 19 a day for occasional users, Rs 149 a month for low data users and Rs 4,999 a month for heavy data users. Devoting an hour of his speech at the RIL's 42th Annual General Meeting, the billionaire industrialist said Jio is targeting acquiring 100 million users in the shortest possible time.

Read More: <http://thewire.in/63281/reliance-announces-free-voice-calling-cheaper-data-tariffs-for-jio-customers/>

Date Accessed: 2.9.2016

### LAW AND JUSTICE

#### **What Singur Teaches Us About Land Rights**

(The Livemint, September 5, 2016)

When the Supreme Court declared last week that the land acquisition in Singur for Tata's Nano factory was "illegal and void", the long struggle of Singur's farmers for their rights bore fruit. In a rare sight, the state and the judiciary stood together to uphold these rights. The Supreme Court verdict notes two significant anomalies in the Singur case. One, the state's acquirement of land for private parties does not classify as a 'public good'. Second, the compulsory provisions to be adhered to before acquiring land were not met by the state government, which took the task upon itself.

Read More: <http://www.livemint.com/Opinion/NxdDt4uovM3BLzDU3PsbxN/What-Singur-teaches-us-about-land-rights.html>

Date Accessed: 5.9.2016

#### **The Muslim Personal Law Board's Intransigence Is Shocking**

(A Faizur Rahman, The Wire, September 5, 2016)

If any Muslim woman had been bold enough to think that the All India Muslim Personal Law Board (AIMPLB) would moderate its medievalism given the unprecedented judicial scrutiny on triple talaq, her hopes stand dashed – perhaps permanently – for such is the outrageousness of some of the board's arguments before the Supreme Court in the Shayara Bano case.

Read More: <http://thewire.in/63995/the-muslim-personal-law-boards-intransigence-is-shocking/>

Date Accessed: 5.9.2016

## Society

### GENDER

#### **Womaniya empowerment: How prohibition has overturned the gender dynamic in Bihar's villages**

(Shoib Danyal, *Scroll*, September 2, 2016)

Bihar's new prohibition law has popularly been described as “draconian” in the English-language press. A new law, passed by the Assembly on August 1, makes the penalties even harsher, imposing near-arbitrary forms of collective punishment. Yet, while the mechanics of the law have been highlighted, the social drivers behind it have been less so. On the ground, prohibition is being pushed by an unprecedented political mobilisation of Bihari women. Whatever the actual effect this law will have on the availability of alcohol, by making the state bend directly to the voice of rural women, it has fundamentally changed the gender dynamic in Bihar’s villages.

Read More: <://scroll.in/article/815376/womaniya-empowerment-how-prohibition-has-overturned-the-gender-dynamic-in-bihars-villages>

Date Accessed: 2.9.2016

#### **Now, govt employees in Tamil Nadu can avail nine months maternity leave**

(B.Sivakumari, *Times of India*, September 1, 2016)

The AIADMK government in Tamil Nadu has fulfilled one more election promise by increasing the maternity leave of government employees from six months to nine months. "In 2011, my government increased the maternity leave from 90 days to six months. Now, the government is increasing the maternity leave from six months to nine months," chief minister J Jayalalithaa said in the assembly.

Read More: <http://timesofindia.indiatimes.com/city/chennai/Now-govt-employees-in-Tamil-Nadu-can-avail-nine-months-maternity-leave/articleshow/53960094.cms>

Date Accessed: 1.9.2016

### SOCIAL JUSTICE

#### **After Russia, India Most ‘Unequal’**

(*The Tribune*, September 4, 2016)

India is the second most ‘unequal’ nation in the world where millionaires, or those with net assets of USD 1 million (Rs 6.7 crore) or more, control over half of its total wealth, says a report. According to wealth research firm New World Wealth, after Russia, India is the most unequal country as 54 per cent of its wealth is in the hands of millionaires. India is among the 10 richest countries in the world with a total individual wealth of USD 5,600 billion, but the average Indian is quite poor. Globally, Russia is the most unequal country where millionaires control over 62 per cent of total wealth.

Read More: <http://www.tribuneindia.com/news/nation/after-russia-india-is-most-unequal/290571.html>

Date Accessed: 5.9.2016

## India and World

### *INDIA IN THE WORLD*

#### **Red Fort notice: Will Modi's new Pakistan policy go beyond rhetoric?**

(Harsh V. Pant, Scroll, August 29, 2016)

Critics describe Modi's Pakistan policy as inconsistent. From inviting Sharif to Modi's 2014 swearing-in ceremony to cancelling talks with Pakistan after its ambassador in India met with Kashmiri separatist leaders, the saga has many twists and turns. The Modi government muted its reaction to the January 2016 terror strike at the Indian Air Force base at Pathankot, in the northern state of Punjab, in the hope that dialogue with the Pakistani civilian establishment was key to management of a turbulent border.

Read More: <http://scroll.in/article/815050/red-fort-notice-will-modis-new-pakistan-policy-go-beyond-rhetoric>

Date of Access: 30.8.2016

#### **India and US sign military logistic agreement boosting defence ties**

(Catch News, August 30, 2016)

29 August, an all important agreement was signed by India and the US, making the two nations logistical allies, and enabling the militaries of both nations to use each other's assets and also provide bases to repair and replenish supplies. Welcoming the signing of the bilateral 'Logistics Exchange Memorandum of Agreement' (LEMOA), Defence Minister Manohar Parrikar and US Defence Secretary Ashton Carter said the pact will facilitate opportunities for "practical engagement and exchange" LEMOA facilitates the provision of logistical support, supplies, and services between the US and Indian militaries on a reimbursable basis, and provides a framework to govern them.

Read More: <http://www.catchnews.com/national-news/india-and-us-sign-military-logistic-agreement-boosting-defence-ties-1472526634.html>

Date of Access: 30.8.2016

### *EAST AND SOUTH EAST ASIA*

#### **India and China: Asia's Uneasy Neighbors**

(Ashok Sajjanhar, The Diplomat, August 22, 2016)

However, while relations with the United States have soared, relations with China are mired in tension and distrust despite the frequent meetings. The hopes that surfaced after Modi's victory that relations with China would improve have been sorely belied. Modi had embraced China with eagerness after coming to power, seeking to make Beijing an active partner in India's economic development. This initiative has fallen flat. China has not accorded appropriate importance to India's concerns as India had hoped. These concerns relate not only to issues bedeviling bilateral ties but equally to China's all out support to its "iron friend," Pakistan. China has been unmindful of Pakistan's funding and support for terrorism, which could adversely impact China's own security in the not too distant a future.

Read More: <http://thediplomat.com/2016/08/india-and-china-asias-uneasy-neighbors/>

Date of Access: 30.8.2016

#### **Trustpolitik on the Korean Peninsula: Dead or Dormant?**

(Katherine H.S Moon and Paul Park, The Diplomat, August 3, 2016)

Early in Park's term, Foreign Minister Yun Byung-se boldly claimed that trustpolitik "is the policy that will be in place for the remainder of Park's presidency." He spoke too soon, since trust between the two Koreas has plummeted even lower than imagined at the outset of the presidency, and the policy itself has been jettisoned in response to the DPRK's nuclear test and missile launches

## India and World

in 2016. But trustpolitik was doomed from the start because of major flaws in its conceptualization and implementation. The major shortcoming is that the policy married improving inter-Korea relations with unification by absorption. Whoever wins the presidential election in 2017 should beware of making the same error.

Read More: <http://thediplomat.com/2016/08/trustpolitik-on-the-korean-peninsula-dead-or-dormant/>

Date of Access: 30.8.2016

## EUROPE

### Don't panic- Brexit might just bring the UK closer to Europe

(Mary Dejevsky, *The Guardian*, September 4, 2016)

May is fortunate that her first big international occasion is the G20. An EU summit would have been complicated for obvious reasons. The G7 makes the UK look smaller and poorer than it is. The G20 affords the new prime minister not only many more bilateral meetings in the margins, but a more accurate representation of the world that faces the UK in its post-EU future.

Read More: <https://www.theguardian.com/commentisfree/2016/sep/04/brexit-uk-europe-empire-theresa-may>

Date Accessed: 5.9.2016

## AMERICAS

### Here's why drug prices rise even when there's plenty of competition

(Melody Peterson, *LA Times*, September 01, 2016)

At least eight pharmaceutical companies sell a decades-old drug that treats gallstones, but the competition has done little to keep its price down.

Instead the price has skyrocketed.

Two years ago, ursodiol's wholesale price was as low as 45 cents a capsule. Then in May 2014, generic drug manufacturer Lannett Co. hiked its price to \$5.10 per capsule, and one by one its competitors followed suit – with most charging nearly the same price.

Experts say this is not how a competitive marketplace is supposed to work.

“When you have a generic drug with eight suppliers you would expect the prices to go down,” said Dana Goldman, director of USC's Leonard D. Schaeffer Center for Health Policy & Economics.

Read More: <http://www.latimes.com/business/la-fi-mylan-price-hikes-20160830-snap-story.html>

Date Accessed: 02.9.2016

### In major win for River Rights, Dams proposed on five Chilean rivers Scrapped

(*Down to Earth*, September 5, 2016)

"Endesa Chile wants to only move forward on projects that are technically and economically viable and that are embraced by the local communities," Endesa Chief Executive Valter Moro said in a statement reported by non-profit, International Rivers. Endesa's climbdown comes after a decades-long, coordinated effort from many groups working in partnership, including Consejo de Defensa de la Patagonia, which includes non-profits such as International Rivers, Ecosistemas, Geute Fundacion Sur, Terram, Aysen Comité Nacional Pro Defensa de La Fauna y Flora and many others.

Read More: <http://www.downtoearth.org.in/news/in-major-win-for-river-rights-dams-proposed-on-five-chilean-rivers-scrapped-55510>

Date Accessed: 5.9.2016

## Opinions/ Books

### OPINIONS

#### The state of Education in India

(Narayan Ramachandran, *Live Mint*, September 5, 2016)

Since the Industrial Revolution, in India and around the world, the tradition of home or community schooling—often centered on the teacher—has gradually been transformed into a human supply chain schooling system centered on the educational institution. As we move towards an information age, nations around the world are grappling with what the next transformation in education needs to be. The current challenge in India remains a 20th century challenge of quantity and quality for its primary and higher education systems.

Read More: <http://www.livemint.com/Opinion/PQmwXBdmg6FWPIPVPtmV7K/The-state-of-education-in-India.html>

Date Accessed: 5.9.2016

#### Enemies of the state? Sedition charges in India rarely get substantiated

(Sourjya Bhowmick, *Catchnews*, August 18, 2016)

The season of sedition has just claimed its latest victim - human rights watchdog Amnesty India. The spell started with Kanhaiya Kumar and his fellow students at Jawaharlal Nehru University, moved on to former Delhi university professor SAR Geelani, before unsettling Hardik Patel of the Patidar agitation and is now on the lookout for more offenders. According to the state, Amnesty and all these people are anti-national - a term that is highly ambiguous under section 124A of the Indian Penal Code.

Read More: <http://www.catchnews.com/india-news/enemies-of-the-state-sedition-charges-in-india-rarely-get-substantiated-1471531966.html>

Date of Access: 30.8.2016

Issue Coordinator: Ms. Wamika Kapur

Connect with RGICS at: [info@rgics.org](mailto:info@rgics.org); [www.rgics.org](http://www.rgics.org)



**Disclaimer:** This document has been prepared by the RGICS staff and has not been seen by the Trustees of the Rajiv Gandhi Foundation (RGF). Further, the views presented in this document in no way reflect the views of the RGF Trustees.

To unsubscribe, please write to us at [info@rgics.org](mailto:info@rgics.org)